TECHNICAL REPORT

ISO/IEC TR 29189

First edition
2015-06-15

Information technology — Biometrics — Evaluation of examiner assisted biometric applications

Technologies de l'information — Biométrie — Évaluation des applications biométriques assistées par un examinateur

Reference number
ISO/IEC TR 29189:2015(E)

© ISO/IEC 2015

COPYRIGHT PROTECTED DOCUMENT

© ISO/IEC 2015, Published in Switzerland

All rights reserved. Unless otherwise specified, no part of this publication may be reproduced or utilized otherwise in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, or posting on the internet or an intranet, without prior written permission. Permission can be requested from either ISO at the address below or ISO's member body in the country of the requester.

ISO copyright office
Ch. de Blandonnet 8 • CP 401
CH-1214 Vernier, Geneva, Switzerland
Tel. +41 22 749 01 11
Fax +41 22 749 09 47
copyright@iso.org
www.iso.org

Contents

Page

Foreword ... **iv**
Introduction ... **v**
1 Scope ... **1**
2 Terms and definitions ... **1**
3 Symbols and abbreviated terms ... **2**
4 Example of an examiner assisted search process ... **2**
5 Factors to consider when evaluating examiner assisted biometric applications ... **4**
5.1 General ... 4
5.2 System-related factors to consider when evaluating examiner assisted biometric applications ... 5
5.2.1 Dependencies in the flow process — Where does the examiner interact with the system? ... 5
5.2.2 System and stage-level performance measurement ... 5
5.2.3 Measuring 'true' operational performance ... 7
5.2.4 The impact of prior probabilities on human performance ... 8
5.2.5 Confidence Levels ... 8
5.2.6 The impact of automated systems on human performance ... 9
5.3 Examiner-related factors to consider when evaluating examiner assisted biometric applications ... 9
5.3.1 An Examiner's perception of the system's accuracy ... 9
5.3.2 Usability and examiner acceptance ... 10
5.3.3 Training and expertise ... 10
5.3.4 Workload ... 11
5.3.5 Bias in decision making ... 11
5.3.6 Individual differences between examiners ... 12
6 Performance evaluation of examiner assisted systems ... **12**
6.1 Types of Evaluation ... 12
6.2 Performance measures for examiner assisted biometric systems ... 13
6.2.1 Introduction ... 13
6.2.2 Measures of accuracy ... 13
6.2.3 Examiner-assisted performance considerations in watch list scenarios ... 14
6.2.4 Discrimination and bias ... 14
6.2.5 Examiner Decision Confidence ... 14
6.2.6 Processing speed ... 14
6.3 Usability assessment ... 15
6.3.1 Introduction ... 15
6.3.2 Qualitative observations ... 15
6.3.3 Questionnaires ... 15
6.3.4 Interviews and focus groups ... 15
6.4 Reporting results ... 15
6.5 Applying controls in evaluations ... 16
6.5.1 Introduction ... 16
6.5.2 Controls for examiner expertise ... 16
6.5.3 Controls for examiner decision bias ... 16
6.5.4 Controls for the test environment ... 17
6.5.5 Controls for variations in examiner input ... 17
6.6 Evaluation challenges ... 18
6.6.1 Introduction ... 18
6.6.2 Challenges with testing on a live operational system ... 18
6.6.3 Challenges in repeatable operational test ... 18
Bibliography ... **19**

© ISO/IEC 2015 – All rights reserved

Foreword

ISO (the International Organization for Standardization) and IEC (the International Electrotechnical Commission) form the specialized system for worldwide standardization. National bodies that are members of ISO or IEC participate in the development of International Standards through technical committees established by the respective organization to deal with particular fields of technical activity. ISO and IEC technical committees collaborate in fields of mutual interest. Other international organizations, governmental and non-governmental, in liaison with ISO and IEC, also take part in the work. In the field of information technology, ISO and IEC have established a joint technical committee, ISO/IEC JTC 1.

The procedures used to develop this document and those intended for its further maintenance are described in the ISO/IEC Directives, Part 1. In particular the different approval criteria needed for the different types of document should be noted. This document was drafted in accordance with the editorial rules of the ISO/IEC Directives, Part 2 (see www.iso.org/directives).

Attention is drawn to the possibility that some of the elements of this document may be the subject of patent rights. ISO and IEC shall not be held responsible for identifying any or all such patent rights. Details of any patent rights identified during the development of the document will be in the Introduction and/or on the ISO list of patent declarations received (see www.iso.org/patents).

Any trade name used in this document is information given for the convenience of users and does not constitute an endorsement.

For an explanation on the meaning of ISO specific terms and expressions related to conformity assessment, as well as information about ISO's adherence to the WTO principles in the Technical Barriers to Trade (TBT), see the following URL: Foreword — Supplementary information.

The committee responsible for this document is ISO/IEC JTC 1, *Information technology*, Subcommittee SC 37, *Biometrics*.

© ISO/IEC 2015 – All rights reserved

Introduction

Biometric identification systems such as those used in forensic applications are typically examiner assisted and not automated to the extent that most biometric systems are. This is particularly the case for applications such as latent fingerprint searching where sample quality can be so poor that the system requires human input. Key processes such as sample capture and preparation, enrolment, template generation, matching result adjudication, and final decision that would otherwise require minimal manual intervention are instead heavily reliant on input from experts (fingerprint examiners in the case of AFIS). These experts can interact with the system at each of these stages to prepare, launch, and/or review the results of biometric searches. The execution and performance of the "end-to-end" search process is thus, a combination of the examiner's role (and capability) and the functionality of the automated biometric system.

This partially automated approach to biometrics using "*examiner assisted*" biometric systems provides value both in assisting the human examiner to perform their role more effectively, and in allowing the expertise of the human examiner to be exploited to assist the automated matching process. Therefore, such systems are most likely to be beneficial in non-real time scenarios where the search response is not necessarily required immediately but the throughput of the system is still high.

Understanding the role of the examiner is crucial, as it impacts on the design of the system, the manner in which it is used, how it is tested, and how the system performance and its individual subcomponents are defined and measured.

The main objectives of this Technical Report are to describe the characteristics of *examiner assisted* biometric applications and, where appropriate, to contrast such applications with mainstream biometric applications.

This Technical Report addresses the issues with assessing the system as a whole, or by testing the *examiner assisted* and automated elements separately.

© ISO/IEC 2015 – All rights reserved

Information technology — Biometrics — Evaluation of examiner assisted biometric applications

1 Scope

The purpose of this Technical Report is to identify and characterize those aspects of performance testing that are unique to examiner assisted biometric applications.

An examiner assisted biometric system has the following characteristics:

— reliant on the interaction and skill of a human examiner for one or more stages of the complete biometric process, be it data capture, enrolment, template generation, or final decision;

— can incorporate identification functionality, verification functionality, or both;

— will use a combination of the examiner's input and the functionality of the biometric algorithm to execute the complete biometric process;

— will likely have inbuilt examination toolsets to assist the human examiner when enrolling biometric samples or when comparing the match results provided by the biometric algorithm.

Although there is a wide variation in the use of the term "examiner" in the context of an "examiner assisted biometric system", as defined in this Technical Report, an "examiner" typically has the following characteristics:

— field expert in the biometric modality being exploited;

— trained to use the system to an advanced degree of proficiency;

— authorized to override the biometric system's decisions in particular when accepting or rejecting a match decision based on their own examination of the biometric samples and the results returned.

Assessing an examiner's level of expertise is excluded from the scope of this Technical Report. However, the skill of the examiner does have a major bearing on system performance and vice versa. Measuring or assessing the ability of an examiner to employ their skills might be necessary to properly evaluate the performance of an examiner-assisted system.

Other individuals, such as administrative users, or subjects whose biometrics are used within the system are not considered in this Technical Report. It is outside the scope of this Technical Report to consider non-expert examiners.

© ISO/IEC 2015 – All rights reserved